



SAN FRANCISCO

2018 - 2019

CITYWIDE WORKFORCE DEVELOPMENT PLAN UPDATE



CCWA

Committee on City **Workforce Alignment**



CITY & COUNTY OF SAN FRANCISCO
DEPARTMENT OF HUMAN RESOURCES



Introduction

In June 2014, the City and County of San Francisco established the Committee on City Workforce Alignment (“Alignment Committee”) through approval of Chapter 30 of the San Francisco Administrative Code. Acknowledging opportunities for system improvement, Chapter 30 required the Alignment Committee—comprised of the City’s primary workforce development agencies—to coordinate services and increase their effectiveness in moving clients through training programs to long-term self-sufficiency.

Until May 2017, the Alignment Committee was chaired by the Mayor’s Deputy Chief of Staff, and included the Board of Supervisors’ President and the department heads of the City’s five largest workforce-investing departments at the time of its inception: the Human Services Agency of San Francisco (HSA); the Office of Economic and Workforce Development (OEWD); the Department of Children, Youth, and Their Families (DCYF); the San Francisco Public Utilities Commission (PUC); and the Department of Public Works (“Public Works”). Chapter 30 requires OEWD to staff and convene the Alignment Committee. In FY 2017-18, the Alignment Committee invited the Human Rights Commission and the Department of Human Resources to become members. As of January 2019, Mayor Breed appointed HRC Director Sheryl Davis and OEWD Director of Workforce Joshua Arce as co-chairs of the Committee on City Workforce Alignment.

Seventeen City agencies provide workforce development services to residents of San Francisco. As additional needs emerge, the Alignment Committee may invite other City agencies to join and lend their expertise in coordinating service delivery and implementing effective programming.

As mandated by Chapter 30, the Alignment Committee must submit a five-year Citywide Workforce Development Plan (“Five-Year Plan”) and annual updates to the San Francisco Workforce Investment board (WISF). Established by the Workforce Innovation and Opportunity Act of 2014 (WIOA), WISF receives and manages the City’s WIOA workforce funding and oversees San Francisco’s workforce development strategies. WISF brings together business, labor, education, government, community-based organizations (CBOs) and other stakeholders to address the supply and demand challenges confronting the workforce.

The Five-Year Plan covers the period from 2017-22 and provides an assessment of the City’s anticipated workforce development capacity, growth opportunities, and the recommended goals and strategies needed to meet identified challenges. From 2016-17, the Alignment Committee developed the Five-Year Plan with feedback from the San Francisco Board of Supervisors, City agencies, the Workforce Community Advisory

Committee (WCAC), and WISF. In late 2017, the Alignment Committee approved the final version of the Plan.

The Five-Year Plan is organized into chapters representing the Alignment Committee's five system recommendations, and it includes specific action items to better serve economically vulnerable populations, formalize the workforce client journey through the system, leverage data systems to improve the user experience, engage labor market information and employers in the development of City programs, and streamline City processes for community-based organization partners.

As required by Chapter 30, the Alignment Committee prepares annual updates on movement towards these recommendations and their corresponding action items. This FY 2018-19 Citywide Workforce Services Alignment Update ("Update") includes descriptions of special projects in service of this mission and discusses the overall significance of this work in positioning our residents for self-sufficiency and upward mobility through a coordinated workforce development strategy. In keeping with the five-year timeline, the Alignment Committee has made progress across all recommendations.

RECOMMENDATION #1

Contribute to breaking the cycle of poverty for San Francisco residents through targeted outreach and service delivery

Many local residents have not prospered from San Francisco's recent period of economic growth. For many, it is the continuation of a long cycle of poverty within their families and communities. Contributors to the City's workforce development pipeline must have all of the tools and partnerships necessary to move these residents out of poverty. Tools and partnerships that address employment barriers and access to services and technology are especially valuable.

Recommended Action(s)	Anticipated Outcome	Status
Formal adoption of the Citywide Workforce Development Plan by all members of the Alignment Committee.	A shared set of goals and action steps for aligning the City's workforce development system.	Complete
Convene quarterly Alignment Committee meetings to reach a common understanding of how workforce programs can work in tandem to specifically address the needs of the economically vulnerable and those with employment barriers. Invite relevant stakeholders, such as HOPE SF and the Office of Resilience and Capital Planning, as appropriate.	A list of operational steps to strengthen connections between programs to better support vulnerable clients.	Ongoing
Led by HSA, identify the number of working age individuals who fall within vulnerable populations, as well as their location and other relevant demographics.	An understanding of the scope of workforce development needs in the City.	Ongoing
Collect pre- and post-program client income data, as part of the FY 2016-17 City Workforce Services Inventory.	An evaluation of the impact programs have on client income.	Ongoing
Create a systemic partnership with City departments and/or initiatives that are serving families and individuals in poverty (such as HSA, HOPE SF, DHS, and APD/CASC) to help connect clients to City-funded workforce development services.	A process for ensuring economically vulnerable residents have access to an array of City services, including workforce development.	Ongoing
Invite the Human Rights Commission to guide the Alignment Committee in applying racial equity considerations to all its activities.	A process for ensuring that racial identity is not a determining factor in one's success.	Complete

Progress Updates

Recommendation #1 reflects the Alignment Committee's commitment to ensuring the workforce development system is a key contributor to breaking the cycle of poverty. The Committee recognizes the necessity of aligning the interests of City partners and community stakeholders in efficient service delivery and developing career pathways for our most vulnerable San Franciscans.

1.1 Adopt the Citywide Workforce Development Plan.

In FY 2017-18, the Alignment Committee formally adopted the Citywide Workforce Development Plan and submitted it to the Workforce Investment San Francisco board (WISF), per Chapter 30. As the Alignment Committee adds new partner agencies to sit on the body, the partner agencies may be permitted to review the plan and recommend updates based on their service area and expertise. With the addition of the Human Rights Commission (HRC), Director Sheryl Davis proposed a number of updates to the plan to prioritize the City's strategic vision for racial and economic equity. The Alignment Committee reviewed these updates and will revise the action plan in FY 2019-20.

1.2 Hold quarterly Alignment Committee meetings.

The Alignment Committee met three times in FY 2018-19. In addition to Alignment meetings, members have continued to host regular, department director-level meetings to provide updates, develop programs, and build stronger network partnerships. In January 2019, Mayor London Breed named the Human Rights Commission Director Sheryl Davis and OEWD Director of Workforce Joshua Arce as co-chairs of the Alignment Committee. Together, they apply an equity lens to oversight and implementation of Alignment projects.

1.3 Identify the population size and characteristics of vulnerable, working age individuals.

With the ultimate goal of openly sharing member departments' data regarding vulnerable populations, the Alignment Committee leverages resources such as public access open data, qualitative data from system clients and providers, and the Planning Department's Neighborhood Spotlights to identify vulnerable populations for targeted service delivery. The Alignment Committee continues to connect department analysts to build data transparency and establish informal and formal data request protocols.

Some member departments have developed data sharing agreements with one another—primarily HSA with DCYF and OEWD with HSA—to share vulnerable populations' data in aggregate or to identify

cross-sections of shared client populations. This type of bidirectional data sharing allows the City generally to explore vulnerable populations' demographics broadly and target service delivery. Departments continue to explore methods to operationalize economic vulnerability and conduct outreach to vulnerable populations.

1.4 Collect pre- and post-program client income data.

OEWD requests pre- and post-program client income data from the 17 departments who participate in the Citywide Workforce Services Inventory ("Inventory"). Over the five years in which OEWD has administered the Inventory, data collection on key demographic data has improved year-over-year through technical assistance and peer review of results. Through these opportunities for one-on-one feedback, OEWD continues to support workforce-serving departments in improving data collection or intake protocols. Nonetheless, many workforce-serving departments have limited wage data collection for workforce clients or may only collect data for specific programs. Results from the FY 2017-18 Inventory demonstrate that client wage increases range from no increase to over \$35 per hour.

1.5 Build systemic City partnerships to serve families and individuals in poverty.

Workforce-serving departments continue to build systemic partnerships with key agencies in service of economically vulnerable populations. As a requirement of the Workforce Innovation and Opportunity Act of 2014 (WIOA) legislation which establishes WISF and OEWD as the workforce development administrators for San Francisco, OEWD established bimonthly One-Stop Operator meetings to discuss service coordination among core WIOA partners. Attendees include: OEWD Director of Sector and Workforce Programs, OEWD Adult Workforce Programs Specialist, Goodwill Industries functioning as the local America Job Center of California (AJCC), HSA CalFresh Director, HSA CalWORKs Director, Department of Rehabilitation District Administrator, Higher Education Consortium & Adult Education Program, and the Employment Development Department.

Through these bi-monthly meetings, partners limit duplication of service delivery through oversight of co-located OEWD workforce development and HSA public benefits assistance services at the AJCC. Through this central entry point, providers may enroll clients in subsistence resources and workforce development resources concurrently. Similarly, OEWD and HSA engage in cross-referral and recruitment for OEWD's City Build and Health Care Academies and public assistance programs, in order to ensure that clients receive the job training and supportive services necessary to achieve long-term employment and wages that sustain self-sufficiency.

San Francisco has continued to improve general service delivery through coordinated workforce development services with HSA, Adult Probation Department (APD), the Department of Rehabilitation

(DOR), and the Department of Child Support Services (DCSS). Per California Workforce Development Board mandate, OEWD developed stronger partnerships and pilot programs with these agencies in service of specific vulnerable populations: public benefits recipients, English language learners, justice-involved clients, individuals with intellectual and/or developmental disabilities, and payment delinquent non-custodial parents. OEWD established memorandums of understanding (MOUs) with these agencies, implemented provider trainings in partnership with DOR, and developed a pilot program for coordinated service delivery with DCSS. In addition to the priority populations identified by state and federal mandates, Alignment departments continue to facilitate partnerships to prioritize San Francisco-specific economically vulnerable populations, including individuals experiencing homelessness, individuals participating in mental health or substance use treatment, the LGBTQ+ community, survivors of domestic violence, people with disabilities, veterans, older adults, and participants in vocational training programs or those who require significant financial assistance to complete post-secondary education.

Reentry and justice-involved individuals face some of the highest barriers to employment, though recidivism rates decline significantly with stable employment opportunities. OEWD managed an eight-month stakeholder engagement process for reentry and justice-involved individuals in partnership with APD, the Sheriff's Office (SHF), and the California Department of Corrections and Rehabilitation (CDCR), which included community partners and service providers such as Five Keys and Goodwill Industries. The engagement yielded MOUs with each agency and reentry workforce development system design recommendations, submitted as grant proposals to the California Workforce Development Board and the Department of Labor.

Lastly, Alignment departments continue to explore innovative new programs to move vulnerable client populations into career pathways with sufficiency wage employment. Regular, director-level meetings yielded a partnership between OEWD and HSA to deliver a no-cost, online bachelor's degree program to highly vulnerable clients who face a ceiling to advancement opportunities due to the limitations of a high school diploma or GED. Started in Mountain View two years ago, the Working Scholars College program allows participants to complete a bachelor's degree in as few as two years, and coursework may be completed on a smart phone. Launched in January, the OEWD-HSA pilot program—intended to test the existing program for feasibility with economically vulnerable San Franciscans—enrolled 17 participants who had accessed public benefits in the past two years and entered entry-level employment with the City and County of San Francisco. Students may earn a bachelor's degree from either Golden Gate University or Thomas Edison State University, a college for working adults.

1.6 Invite the Human Rights Commission to the Alignment Committee to apply racial equity lens.

With the addition of HRC, the Alignment Committee gained the expertise to reflect on the racial equity

issues present in the San Francisco economic landscape. Members of the Alignment Committee (OEWD, HSA, DCYF) have enrolled in HRC's Government Alliance on Racial Equity (GARE) training, an intensive two-year training on implementing system-wide, racial equity change. One outcome of this macro intervention is a commitment to investing in economically vulnerable youth and TAY for improved socioecological outcomes along the life course.

In preparation for the pivot in City policy, DCYF engaged in a yearlong department training on results-based accountability, an intensive evaluation mechanism for measuring and achieving impact. This process resulted in agency-wide mission alignment and establish short- and long-term outcomes for Citywide youth programming. From this process, DCYF made substantial investments into youth workforce development programs, and continues to fund programming across a five-year grant term.

Further catalyzing youth programs, Mayor London Breed announced the Opportunities for All (OFA) campaign in partnership with HRC, DCYF, OEWD, San Francisco Unified School District, and other community-based organizations and employers. Mayor Breed's OFA aims to fight systemic inequality by connecting high school students to paid internships, employment, training, and educational opportunities, ultimately creating pathways for youth to develop networks, gain experience, and become adults with the capacity and income to live and work in the City.

OFA has brought together many City organizations, an array of nonprofits and private sector businesses, and other key stakeholders to develop shared goals and processes to serve youth and their families through collaboration and partnership. OFA has established a shared intake process, outreach plan, and data collection system. Additionally, University of San Francisco and Stanford University are supporting OFA program evaluation, including tracking participations in primary and secondary programs for youth and their families.

The Alignment Committee continues to lend its expertise to the OFA campaign, leveraging learnings and best practices from the initiative to expand coordinated services to non-youth programs.

RECOMMENDATION #2

Develop a Workforce Transit Map to show how clients navigate the workforce development system

To effectively move our most economically vulnerable residents into unsubsidized employment with upward mobility pathways, the system must have a clear picture of how clients are currently navigating the system. A visual representation of the client experience would allow the Alignment Committee and other system stakeholders to identify outreach, service, and communication gaps delaying positive outcomes for clients. Eliminating these gaps would result in a seamless pipeline for clients from any entry point to self-sufficiency, economic resiliency, and upward mobility.

Recommended Action(s)	Anticipated Outcome	Status
Convene a working group of the Alignment Committee to develop a “Workforce Transit Map” depicting the sequence of existing services and programs along a continuum of services aimed at moving clients towards unsubsidized employment and upward mobility, and detailing current client experience of the system.	Identification of outreach, service, and communication gaps between programs, departments, and other system stakeholders.	To Be Revised
Formal adoption of the “Workforce Transit Map” by all members of the Alignment Committee.	A unifying vision of the workforce development system.	To Be Revised
Identify gaps in the system for workforce system clients, particularly residents in poverty, and develop solutions and systems changes to improve access to optimally-sequenced, City-funded training programs and other workforce development services, using the Workforce Transit Map as a resource.	Help residents in poverty better navigate City-funded workforce development programs and improve transitions from one City-funded program to another.	Ongoing

Progress Updates

Recommendation #2 recognizes our need for tools that can identify gaps in our workforce system. By mapping the client experience in our current network, the Alignment Committee believes that the system would be able to identify predictable system pathways and intervention points, best practices for communication between partners and programs, and develop data-driven efficiencies in service delivery.

2.1 Develop a Workforce Transit Map.

In FY 2017-18, the Alignment Committee solicited the Office of Civic Innovation to sponsor the development of a Workforce Transit Map in partnership with a local employer. Google worked with OEWD and HSA for nine months to research the workforce development system and isolate predictable patterns in the client journey. Due to qualitative data from over 70 interviews with clients and workforce development providers, Google determined that the workforce development system is sprawling and each client's experience was unique to their life course.

2.2 Adopt the Workforce Transit Map.

Despite limited transit map findings, Google made several system recommendations to the Alignment Committee to improve the user experience, including the development of a City client database to collect big data on clients' movement through the workforce development system. The Alignment Committee agreed that the Workforce Transit Map recommendation needed to be revised and committed to integrating current data systems in order to capture high-quality data about service touch points and dosage, with the ultimate goal of isolating a true Workforce Transit Map for different user types and target populations.

2.3 Identify gaps in the system and improve access to training programs and services.

Despite difficulties in isolating a predictable client journey with the available data, Google's research illuminated a number of resolvable pain points in the user experience. Data collected during this project demonstrated that the workforce development system is broad and confusing. Clients often do not know that they are receiving workforce development services, or find the plethora of system entry points to be a barrier to service delivery.

As a consequence of findings from the Google Civic Bridge project, OEWD solicited a marketing and design consultancy to improve messaging around service delivery touch points, develop collateral about the

workforce development system and OEWD services, and conduct a website overhaul. In an effort to resolve system-level confusion, HSA revamped its website to be more user-friendly and improve language access over the last several years.

With the addition of HRC this past year, the Alignment Committee will revisit creating a Workforce Transit Map. In partnership with the Harvard Business School, the HRC coordinated a study that explores the impact of City programs on three generations of families enrolled in multiple City-administered or City-funded programs. Harvard Business School made recommendations regarding structure, scale, and measuring outcomes from OFA.

The Alignment Committee reviewed the HRC study to understand system gaps, failures, challenges, successes, and best practices. The findings from the study will inform a map on how these clients navigated the workforce development system, which the Alignment Committee will take up again in FY 2019-20.

RECOMMENDATION #3

Build data sharing infrastructure across City workforce development departments

Once we have a shared understanding of the current and desired client experience, we must build data sharing infrastructure to inform how best to move clients through the pipeline. City departments need to agree on a common set of data elements that will be collected and reported by their respective programs. This data must inform system stakeholders of client milestones to facilitate successful progression through the pipeline. A universal client management system is necessary for this level of data sharing.

Recommended Action(s)	Anticipated Outcome	Status
Convene a joint working group of the Alignment Committee and nonprofit service providers to draft a common set of data elements that would allow system stakeholders to track clients at any point in the pipeline, as well as assess system success.	An agreed-upon set of common data elements that community-based organizations can collect and City departments can use for reporting and evaluation purposes.	Complete
Formal adoption of common data elements by all members of the Alignment Committee; these data elements will be collected and analyzed as part of the FY 2017-18 City Workforce Services Inventory.	A more comprehensive system-wide data set to guide decision making about outreach and service delivery strategies.	Complete
Connect the Human Services Agency's Salesforce system with the Office of Economic and Workforce Development's Jobs Portal.	Pilot data sharing between workforce development departments.	Ongoing
Convene a working group of the Alignment Committee to develop data sharing agreements between departments, using resources from the City's ShareSF Program.	Discovery of challenges and opportunities with a shared client management system.	Ongoing
Based on findings from the working group on client data reporting requirements and needs, submit a budget request to expand the capacity and connectivity of the Jobs Portal.	Ability to track workforce clients from entry to exit; make meaningful referrals; evaluate system success by unsubsidized employment and upward mobility	Planning

Progress Updates

Recommendation #3 seeks to create infrastructure to identify system and client needs efficiently. This recommendation necessitates the standardization of program data across all key agencies and requires the infrastructure to share client information across departments.

3.1 Draft a common set of data elements to track clients and assess system outcomes.

In FY 2016-17, OEWD hosted a Data Working Group to determine key data elements for review and evaluation of workforce development programs. The FY 2016-17 Inventory adopted these data elements, and they have been incorporated in each Inventory thereafter. Results from the FY 2017-18 Inventory demonstrated that the City implements 262 workforce development programs, either within departments or through external service providers. City departments hold 154 contracts with 132 community-based providers and spent \$125 million on workforce development programming in FY 2017-18.

3.2 Adopt data elements in City Workforce Services Inventory.

Through process improvements and user experience research related to the FY 2017-18 Inventory, OEWD determined that there were additional data elements which were absent from those identified by the Data Working Group. OEWD incorporated four different measures of client counts in order to operationalize system load, program breadth, and service provider efficiency. OEWD also provided analysts with the ability to configure data elements to their area of practice, and consequently improved data collection and completion. OEWD continues to engage analysts in a peer review process and solicits feedback on data elements in keeping with best practices in research and data management. See Appendix A for further discussion of FY 2017-18 Citywide Workforce Services Inventory findings.

3.3 Connect SFHSA's client data systems with OEWD's client data systems.

In FY 2018-19, OEWD created a data warehouse, which centralizes all client data from OEWD systems and permits staff to develop business processes for cleaning and quality control. Through the development of this tool, OEWD is able to more easily integrate OEWD data systems with City partners' systems, share client data, and track clients' movement through the system.

As the largest service providers for workforce development clients, HSA and OEWD recognized that system coordination may be most impactful if the agencies' data systems worked in concert to limit the intake process, shorten service delivery time, and maximize funding for service providers. Separately, OEWD and SFHSA each fund approximately 50 community-based organizations to execute workforce development

services. While some funding overlap exists, HSA and OEWD have not formalized client co-enrollment at mutual providers.

In an effort to pilot client co-enrollment last year, OEWD co-located HSA eligibility workers at the OEWD Comprehensive Access Point, the Goodwill AJCC. At the AJCC, clients may complete OEWD and HSA intake, access the full portfolio of OEWD workforce development services, receive referral to HSA health and human services, and enroll in public benefits. While a step in the right direction, co-location comes with its own challenges for co-enrollment, including reliance on client self-selection for services, limited on-site service coordination, and increased administrative burden to clients and agencies.

3.4 Develop data sharing agreements among member departments.

Consequently, HSA and OEWD committed to linking client data systems through a co-enrollment pilot and a data-sharing project. Working with the Controller's Office, OEWD and HSA mapped their data systems to identify data element and data field overlap for service delivery, and engaged in current- and future-state business process mapping for client co-enrollment. The Controller's Office facilitated the creation of a data-sharing MOU, which may be used as a template for other workforce-serving departments. The agencies have documented this process to share with other agencies to promote and improve data system linkage.

Through this and other data-related projects, HSA and OEWD achieved greater transparency around data availability, data quality, and legal limitations on data sharing. Through legal basis established by the California Welfare and Institutions Code (WIC) and the California Unemployment Insurance Code (UIC), HSA receives wage base information for all clients who have received public benefits for up to three years post-program exit from the California Employment Development Division (EDD). Wage base information is useful for determining client retention in employment. OEWD submitted requests to EDD to access similar information for OEWD-funded clients who exited programs to assess job retention and program efficacy.

After denials for retention data from EDD, and as a solution to soliciting post-program income data and measuring retention outcomes, OEWD and the California Workforce Association (CWA) drafted and lobbied for an amendment to the Unemployment Insurance Code (UIC). Many sections of the UIC permit the sharing of unemployment insurance wage base data to validate quarterly income. The amendment would permit unemployment insurance wage base data sharing from EDD with local workforce development departments.

3.4 Submit a budget request to expand City workforce development databases, specifically JobsPortal.

This recommended action item is on hold as OEWD and HSA explore the feasibility of linking the OEWD data warehouse to HSA's data systems.

RECOMMENDATION #4

Actively use demand-side relationships and data to guide workforce development programming

Supply-side data from programs and clients is only one half of the workforce development pipeline. Demand-side relationships with private and public employers are essential for guiding program curricula, forecasting actionable hiring opportunities, and providing monetary support for system offerings. System stakeholders must leverage existing relationships and build new ones to ensure all contributors have the information and connectivity necessary to move clients through the pipeline into employment opportunities.

Recommended Action(s)	Anticipated Outcome	Status
Led by DHR, convene a public sector working group composed of department heads and human resources specialists from the City departments most impacted by employee retirements, to plan for near and long-term succession and general hiring needs and strategize how low-income and underemployed residents can access these opportunities.	Increased human resources efficiencies; greater entry and mobility options for jobseekers.	In Planning
Refer to City resources, such as the City's 10-Year Capital Plan, to understand upcoming hiring opportunities and work with the appropriate partners to develop plans for local workforce development needs.	Increased program efficiencies; greater entry and mobility options for jobseekers.	Ongoing
Develop common strategies for educating workforce development clients about City employment opportunities and for providing coaching and/or support to the City's application process.	Greater entry and mobility options for jobseekers.	Complete
Led by OEWD and HSA, conduct an easy-to-replicate analysis of near and long-term (6+ months) hiring, using labor market information and private sector hiring forecasts, to share with departments and nonprofit service providers.	Increased training and placement program efficiencies; greater entry and mobility options for jobseekers; increased private investment in the public workforce system.	Ongoing
Issue a policy brief based on primary stakeholder conversations and case study research, which will cover best practices and outline options for private sector investment into the workforce development system.	Increased private investment in the public workforce system; improved outcomes.	Ongoing
Convene a working group of the Alignment Committee to discuss how to coordinate business services across the departments that rely on employer relationships to drive hiring from their programs.	Increased program efficiencies; greater entry and mobility options for jobseekers.	Planning

Progress Updates

Recommendation #4 acknowledges that, in order for the City to keep clients at the center of its workforce program planning and implementation, the City must assess demand-side data to understand where jobs and training programs may make the greatest impact. Employers are critical system stakeholders and the City must include them in the conversation to move clients into a pipeline for self-sufficiency wage employment.

4.1 Determine near and long-term succession planning and general hiring needs with DHR.

This recommended action suggested that DHR convene a public sector working group to identify long-term succession hiring and general hiring needs. In service of these long-term outcomes, and with respect to each agencies' sensitive hiring needs, DHR has engaged in one-on-one conversations with departments in order to isolate labor market information and engage departments in succession planning. Using this information, DHR will engage with the Alignment Committee to recommend training and employment pathway opportunities.

4.2 Refer to City resources to understand upcoming hiring opportunities and develop plans.

In FY 2018-19, DHR and OEWD worked together to review City classifications, identify entry-level classifications within the City, map career pathways, and propose amendments to the hiring process to improve placement for individuals on public benefits or in transitional employment with the City. This project was put on hold and will be resumed in FY 2019-20.

4.3 Develop strategy to educate workforce clients about City employment opportunities.

Outside of City internal hiring processes, OEWD and DHR also piloted the Pathways to Civil Service workshop to train workforce development professionals on the City hiring process. This workshop is the first step to widely training practitioners and clients on the City hiring process, timeline, and civil service opportunities. The Alignment Committee will explore releasing this training to other departments and to community-based organizations at the behest of DHR in FY 2019-20.

4.4 Conduct analysis of near and long-term hiring using labor market information and private sector forecasts.

To meet the needs of workers and industry, OEWD convened SFMTA, DHR, City College of San Francisco, and private sector employers to facilitate the creation of City Drive, a training academy to transition private sector transportation employees and contractors to public service. City Drive evolved in response to mass layoffs of private sector bus drivers and an SFMTA labor shortage for MUNI bus drivers. This endeavor required coordination of a number of key stakeholders to fast track a training academy curriculum and training provider

to prevent disconnected workers from entering long-term unemployment. Through City Drive, experienced drivers will be able to complete training, compile required documentation and commercial licenses, and earn a sustainable wage within a matter of months, while SFMTA will be able to fill a current labor shortage for MUNI.

In an effort to engage in regular processes for general labor market information and standardize sharing with providers and City agencies, OEWD created a quarterly labor market newsletter. The resource includes San Francisco economic conditions, job posting analytics, and in-demand industry and occupation snapshots. The newsletter is currently in user testing and will launch in FY 2019-20.

4.5 Issue a policy brief on private sector investment into the workforce development system.

OEWD drafted a policy brief and it is currently under review.

4.6 Convene a working group to coordinate business services across departments.

OEWD and its mandated regional partners in San Mateo, Santa Clara, San Jose, and San Benito received State funding to convene employers and coordinate business services for two regional initiatives. From these large system improvement projects, OEWD will take lessons learned to the City and County of San Francisco to explore coordination of City-funded business services.

The first initiative created infrastructure for regional business services coordination for the health care industry. This group convenes employers, and is responsible for sharing labor market information, developing sector-specific and general industry best practices for employer engagement, and building partnerships to inform program development and demand.

The second initiative, established through a competitive grant award from the California Workforce Development Board, focuses on prototyping a system design for regional tech apprenticeship. The project is employer-driven and engages tech sector employers for labor market information and program development. Both initiatives are underway and will continue through FY 2019-2020.

From lessons learned in these two employer engagement projects, OEWD will make further recommendations for convening employers and coordinating business services across the City workforce development system.

RECOMMENDATION #5

Continue to streamline procurement and contracting across City workforce development departments

The tools and partnerships that effectively move clients along the pipeline can be made more efficient through administrative improvements. For City workforce development departments who contract service delivery to community-based organizations, efficiencies may be gained through streamlining procurement and contracting. Realized cost savings may mean more money for programs and clients.

Recommended Action(s)	Anticipated Outcome	Status
Align planning processes through shared procurement schedules and strategies.	Potential cost savings and maximized resources.	Ongoing
Coordinated by OEWD, convene working groups to identify overlap in contracts with CBOs receiving workforce funds from three or more City Departments. Where applicable, standardize activities, outcomes and workforce development terminology.	Potential cost savings and maximized resources.	Ongoing
Explore the implementation of joint workforce program monitoring, using resources from the City Controller's Office.	Potential cost savings and maximized resources; consistent performance expectations.	Ongoing

Progress Updates

The final recommendation acknowledges that all workforce services and infrastructure development requires financial investment. To maximize the City's investment in workforce development, the Alignment Committee seeks to ensure that the administration of contracts to CBOs is as efficient as possible, with maximum impact for our client populations.

5.1 Develop shared procurement schedules and strategies.

Agencies continue to explore shared procurement strategies through open communication around timeline and funding priorities. OEWD and APD explored releasing a shared procurement for the Reentry Specialized Access Point (OEWD) and Community Assessment and Service Center (APD), both of which provide workforce development services. The agencies were able to link the procurement timeline, but due to the City's grant making requirements, were unable to make grants to the same provider. From these lessons learned, agencies are exploring best practices, which may be adapted to the City grant making context.

5.2 Identify overlap in multi-agency City contracts with CBOs and standardize outcomes.

As consistent data comes out of the Workforce Inventory and can be validated with additional information from the Controller's Office and Contract Monitoring Division, the Alignment Committee will explore the feasibility of standardizing outcomes across contracts and service delivery models.

5.3 Explore joint workforce program monitoring.

In FY 2018, the Controller Office conducted an audit of 153 community-based organizations with joint funding across APD, the Arts Commission, DCYF, Department on the Status of Women, DPH, Children and Families Commission, HSA, Department of Homelessness and Supportive Housing, MOHCD, OEWD, and SHF. While the Controller's Office intended to establish a Joint Fiscal Monitoring and Joint Program Monitoring initiatives to assess grantee outcomes, the Program Monitoring initiative remains in planning.

Instead, the Joint Fiscal Monitoring Program touched on program performance as a subset of organization governance practices. The Monitoring Group referred community-based organizations to technical assistance or nonprofit consulting services when they demonstrated poor fiscal and/or program outcomes, metrics which tend to inform one another. Through this process, community-based organizations funded by more than one agency have demonstrated decreased adverse findings and referrals over time due to improvements in performance and compliance. Members of the Workforce Community Advisory Committee (WCAC)

commended the Controller's Office for providing these resources and underscored the importance of helping community-based organizations establish adequate fiscal controls and improve organization governance practices.

The WCAC also noted that the joint monitoring process limits the administrative burden on community-based organizations, yet comes with significant challenges, such as lack of coordination among agencies to identify mutual outcomes, and inconsistent guidance from the City, which affects preparation activities. The WCAC requests that the Alignment Committee advocate for agency coordination around City joint monitoring.

The Alignment Committee also notes that the City's mandated outcomes and its monitoring process may limit community-based organizations that conduct the work necessary to move clients along a path to well-being and economic self-sufficiency, but do not conform to mandated or prescribed benchmarks of success. The Alignment Committee recommends that the City's joint monitoring continues to be a collaborative and flexible process whereby the City weighs impact and where community-based organizations may be offered guidance and coaching with a culturally competent and culturally humble approach.



CONCLUSION

After two years of strategic engagement, the Alignment Committee has sparked changes in City workforce programming. With the primary priority of convening key system stakeholders, the Alignment Committee has created cohesive goals, built successful partnerships, prioritized resources towards impacted communities, improved evaluation and data collection processes for the annual workforce inventory, engaged stakeholders in system improvement conversations, initiated developing the infrastructure necessary to align all moving parts, and disseminated information wider and transparently.

Moving forward, the Alignment Committee plans to continue this work, further integrating necessary infrastructure to promote a seamless workforce system and will support departments in following the roadmap identified in the Plan. The Alignment Committee has made significant system and infrastructure improvements in the past year, and plans to use the momentum to create lasting change in the San Francisco workforce system in service to our clients.



APPENDIX A

FY 2017-18 Workforce Inventory Findings

DRAFT