Draft Minutes of The September 9, 2020 Meeting of the Workforce Investment San Francisco (WISF)

This meeting was held via Zoom Conference pursuant to Governor Newsom’s Executive Order N-25-20 (March 12, 2020) and Mayor Breed’s Third Supplement to Mayoral Proclamation Declaring the Existence of a Local Emergency Dated February 25, 2020 (March 17, 2020).

Participants Were Asked to Register in Advance for this Meeting:
https://zoom.us/meeting/register/tJEpcOirqTwsHdQUP1TL0c1d-BIHEFET1q36

WISF Members Present
Kevin Carroll, Hotel Council of San Francisco
Jeanine Cotter, Luminalt Solar Energy Corp.
Shamann Walton, San Francisco Board of Supervisors
Rafael Mandelman, San Francisco Board of Supervisors
Jorge Tapia, California Employment Development Department (EDD)
Edward Battista, Sutter Health
Sam Rodriguez, Rodriguez Strategic Partners, LLC
Aaron Michel, 1984 Ventures
Ramon Hernandez, Laborers Local 261
Ruben Santana, Rubecon

WISF Members Absent
Jeffrey Chiu, UCSF
Alex Randolph, UBER

Opening Remarks and Meeting Guidelines from Chair Kevin Carroll (Discussion Item)

Kevin Carroll, WISF Chair, introduced himself and called the meeting to order at 9:05 AM. Mr. Carroll welcomed the members.

Mr. Carroll announced that the meeting was being held via Zoom teleconference pursuant to Governor Newsom’s Executive Order N-25-20 (March 12, 2020) and Mayor Breed’s Third Supplement to Mayoral Proclamation Declaring the Existence of a Local Emergency Dated February 25, 2020 (March 17, 2020).

Roll Call

Mr. Carroll then called on Iris Rollins to conduct roll call.

OEWD Director Remarks (Discussion Item)

Chair Carroll called on OEWD Director Joaquin Torres to address the board to give brief update on COVID relief work OEWD has been involved with. Director Torres thanked the members for their partnership, guidance, and support that they have been providing throughout this pandemic. He went on to thank Supervisors Walton and Mandelman for their support in helping to provide clarity to businesses about the processes for both relief and for reopening. He reported on the progress of the Right to Recover Program, which manages about $2 million dollars in relief to support 1500 individuals in total.
He noted that on March 26th, the City launched the Workers and Families First Program making $10 million available to provide paid sick leave funds for those employers who were providing it to their employees.

He spoke further on the Immigrant Worker Fund, which was launched in mid-May, making $400,000 available through the philanthropic efforts of Give2SF. The fund can serve about 2000 households that did not have access to federal or state resources with supportive services payments of $200 per individual. He recognized the Family Relief Fund, launched by Mayor Breed and Supervisor Walton with $4.9 million of Give2SF funds to provide $500 per month to families affected by COVID-19 who cannot access federal benefits.

Director Torres noted the ‘real time’ access to information that has been provided through the Office of Economic and Workforce Development’s workforce hotline which has provided services to over 8300 individuals since March. The department is focused on reopening and recovery right now. People need to get back to work, to provide for themselves and for their families. He noted that a fair and equitable recovery is what empowers communities of color here in San Francisco who have been disproportionately impacted not only in this region, but across the country.

Adoption of Agenda (Action Items)

Ms. Rollins confirmed that quorum was present. Chair Carroll asked for a motion to adopt the agenda. Mr. Michel made the motion, which was seconded by Mr. Lavery. The motion passed.

Chair Carroll asked for a motion to adopt the minutes from both the March 2020 and June 2020 meetings. Mr. Lavery made the motion, which was seconded by Mr. Doherty. The motion passed.

WISF Board Member Profile Aaron Michael (Discussion Item)

Chair Carrol introduced Aaron Michel for this month’s Board Member Spotlight. Aaron moved to the Bay Area 12 years ago from Boston. He started PathSource which enables people to research what career they wanted to get into and look at educational requirements and opportunities. Mr. Michel is currently a partner at 1984 Ventures which focuses on companies using tech in antiquated industries. He discussed what venture capital can tell us about tech in the workforce. Ninety-five percent of the pitches they receive are for AI and Automation. Tech is not just it’s own sector. It is in every sector. He is worried about the impact of automation on the workforce, particularly during this great recession. Companies that moved from workers providing customer service to automated chat bots are most likely not going to return to having workers provide this type of customer support. He believes that these are the kinds of issues that the Board should be discussing.

A copy of Aaron Michael’s presentation can be found here; https://oewd.org/meeting/workforce-investment-san-francisco-wisf-september-9-2020-supporting-documents

Discussion of Board Member Engagement (Discussion Item)

Chair Carroll opened up a discussion with members regarding board engagement. He wants to make sure that everyone has a chance to be heard. He asked board members for their thoughts on how the board can better engage with each other and how staff can deepen their relationship with the board, noting that members bring a great deal of expertise that brings value to this work.

Member Aaron Michel shared feedback from member Jeff Chiu who was not able to attend. Member Chiu identified the need to better understand the role of the board and what does OEWD want from the board. He relayed that member Chiu believed the board should advise on workforce strategy and focus more on accountability metrics.
Member Chhavi Sahni shared that the Golden Gate Restaurant Association has been doing a good deal of work with OEWD. She wondered what the best way was to communicate what they were doing that would be helpful to the board.

Member Ann Weeby shared how much she appreciated the sharing that members did in the March meeting about how their industries were responding to the crisis and what the urgent needs in the city were. She thought that it was a good way to do an initial assessment of what was going on in the city and wondered how to continue this on a mid and long-term level to understand the trends that members were seeing and following given their expertise. She offered to help with the shaping of the agenda in the future stating that having members more involved in shaping the agenda will help with board engagement.

Chair Carroll suggested bringing this to the Executive Committee and possibly developing a question that could be sent to members in advance for them to think about and bring back to the next meeting.

Vice Chair Jeanine Cotter noted that in reflecting on what Director Torres stated regarding delivering a fair and equitable recovery and also allocating resources and prioritizing those resources, where there is the most need, those communities most impacted are often invisible to the board. She supported continuing having community members and organizations to present, but perhaps providing a framework that would elevate those voices to share what is working, what is not working, and what is needed. She noted that members on the board have access to resources beyond city funding that can be leveraged.

Member Theresa Woo noted there is a good deal of expertise around the table amongst members. Perhaps there could be a way to share those skill sets. For example, as a representative for the California Department of Rehabilitation, she could offer a presentation on incorporating more people with disabilities into the workforce. She suggested polling the board to see if there were any areas of expertise that they would be willing to give a presentation as a way to increase members knowledge and get to know each other better.

Chair Carroll then asked Director Arce for a response on what members shared.

Director Arce thanked Mr. Michel for raising the issue of board member engagement. San Francisco’s workforce board is unique in that most other workforce boards throughout the state only meet to approve federal resource allocations and resources. San Francisco is fortunate to have a Mayor and Board of Supervisors that provide additional local funding to pursue the City’s workforce objectives and the WISF helps in shaping that conversation. He noted that OEWD is in regular contact with local employers and industry leaders, as well as education partners, around what the department is doing and building on the work of the board. Supervisors Mandelman and Walton also play a role in approving the department’s budget. The department continues to find ways to promote community voice to make sure that they hear directly from those community members that the department serves with workforce resources. The Mayor is committed to ensuring that no one is left behind in this economic recovery.

The department is still planning on providing a WIOA 101 for the board, but it may be outside of the December meeting given other critical items that will be on that meeting agenda including OEWD’s release of a Request For Proposals based on an equity framework and the reporting back of service outcomes for the past program year.
Director Arce stated that three things that shape his presentation

1. Workers and businesses continue to be impacted by the pandemic.
2. OEWD and community and labor partners are continuing to meet the needs of displaced workers and vulnerable community members, and
3. The Mayor and Board of Supervisors have invested resources into OEWD’s 2020-2021 budget to:
   • Support unemployed San Franciscans during the crisis.
   • Addressing persistent employment inequities, and
   • Emerge from the pandemic even stronger.

Director Arce shared data on unemployment from the Employment Development Department (EDD) through the month of July

He then shared data from EDD on the change in employment since February 2020 by industry, noting the significant job losses in the Leisure and Hospitality sector from February through July (-56,300), as well as the Nonprofit sector (-4,600).

Director Arce then shared data on the outreach and worker relief efforts being led by OEWD. Over 8,300 calls have come in through the department hotline. The department has provided over 270 webinar events reaching over 6,600 participants. Other staff are participating as disaster response workers.

Director Arce highlighted community response efforts in the Mission, Chinatown, Fillmore, and Hunter’s Point neighborhoods.

Director Arce shared a power point presentation, a copy of which can be found here https://oewd.org/meeting/workforce-investment-san-francisco-wisf-september-9-2020-supporting-documents

Chair Carroll welcomed neighborhood spotlight guests Dr. Monique Le Sarre, Director Gwendolyn Brown, Director Cheryl Davis, and Director Shakira Simley. The group then presented information on the history of Black San Francisco, covering topics such as urban removal or “redevelopment,” the background of the Coalition, and reparations. They highlighted their advocacy efforts, expertise, and core objectives.

The presentation can be found here: https://oewd.org/meeting/workforce-investment-san-francisco-wisf-september-9-2020-supporting-documents

Mr. Carroll called for a motion to adjourn the meeting and the meeting was adjourned at 11:04 A.M.